



# STAFF REPORT

Measure X Citizens' Oversight Committee

**Date:** May 18, 2023  
**To:** Measure X Citizens' Oversight Committee  
**From:** Michael Chandler, City Manager  
**Prepared By:** Lauren Sugayan, Assistant City Manager  
**Subject:** Measure X – Citizens' Oversight Committee Annual Report

---

## Recommendation

Receive update, hold discussion, provide input to staff, and accept the Measure X Citizens' Oversight Committee Annual Report for FY 2021-22 and forward to the next available City Council meeting.

## Background

On November 6, 2018, almost seventy-three percent (73%) of Martinez voters approved Measure X to increase the transaction and use sales tax by an additional one-half (0.50%) percent for 15 years to fund general City services consistent with community priorities.

As part of the Measure X ballot initiative, the City Council approved a "Community-Identified Spending Priorities Plan" on July 23, 2018. The spending priorities were based on the results of an independent survey that indicated support for a local general sales tax measure to address quality of life and essential services. Within the core areas of Public Safety, City Infrastructure, and Parks, Open Space and Recreation, these key priorities were identified:

- maintaining 911 response times
- recruiting and retaining experienced police officers
- preventing and investigating violent crimes
- addressing homelessness
- providing resources for school safety
- maintaining storm drains and pollution prevention
- maintaining parks and open space
- maintaining Martinez's Senior Center and programs
- maintaining youth and recreation programs

On February 20, 2019, the Measure X Oversight Committee Bylaws were adopted by the City Council via Resolution No. 18-19. The Oversight Committee's role is limited to the following specific duties, as detailed in Section 3.1 of the Bylaws:

- a) *Review semi-annual revenue and expenditure reports produced by the City and other relevant reports and information regarding the Transactions and Use Tax; and*
- b) *Provide to the City Council an annual report on whether revenues were expended efficiently and effectively and recommendations, if any, of ways to ensure that future revenues are expended efficiently and effectively.*

Additionally, Section 3.1 of the Bylaws also specifies the following areas in which the Committee will not have purview:

- c) *In order to preserve the integrity and independence of the oversight process, Committee members shall not play a role in contracting or project management for projects funded through revenue from Measure X.*
- d) *The Committee is not charged with decision-making on spending priorities, schedules, project details, or financing plans.*

The Bylaws further specify the Oversight Committee is to be comprised of no more than seven (7) members, one of which is the City Treasurer, with six (6) at-large members, three of which will serve three (3) year terms, and three of which will serve four (4) year terms.

## **Discussion**

### **Fiscal Review Process**

Each fiscal year, the City is required to have a financial audit conducted by an independent certified public accountancy firm. The CPA firm of Maze and Associates is the City's independent external auditor. The City's Fiscal Year 2022-23 audit was completed in April 2023 in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP). The auditors' opinion was that the financial statements fairly represent the financial position of the City as of June 30, 2022. On May 3, 2023, the audit was received and accepted by the City Council.

### **Baseline Reporting**

At its February 20, 2020 meeting, the Oversight Committee held a robust discussion regarding the spending priorities and how they should present information within the annual report (starting with Fiscal Year 2018-19) to demonstrate that the funds were spent "efficiently and effectively" consistent with community priorities as stated in the Bylaws. The Oversight Committee acknowledged the challenges of making a somewhat subjective determination of what constitutes "efficiently and effectively" and wanted staff to focus on more quantifiable measures.

A consensus reached among the Committee was to compare "baseline" expenses and staffing levels within given community priority categories (Public Safety, City Infrastructure, Parks and Open Space, and Recreation and Senior Center) from Fiscal Year 2017-18, as the most recent audited year which did not receive any revenue from

Measure X, with subsequent budgets that did receive Measure X revenue, starting with Fiscal Year 2018-19 (which began receiving Measure X proceeds during the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter). The Oversight Committee felt these comparisons would help illustrate how the additional funds received from the measure contributed to support community priorities. At its meeting of October 27, 2022, the Oversight Committee recommended presenting more years of Measure X information within the annual report (still keeping the “baseline” pre-Measure X year of Fiscal Year 2017-18) to provide trend detail and demonstrate that the funds were spent “efficiently and effectively” consistent with community priorities as stated in the Bylaws. The Oversight Committee also asked for the outcomes section of future annual reports to more closely align with the fiscal year period in question. Finally, the Oversight Committee also discussed the need for continued awareness of the 15-year sunset clause of the Measure.

### Financial and Staffing Summaries

Consistent with the methodology created by the Oversight Committee in 2020 and updated to subsequent request for additional years of information in 2022, the chart below compares the audited expenditures from “baseline” Fiscal 2017-18 to the two most recently completed fiscal years (2020-21 and 2021-22) within core areas of the City’s operations closely aligned with the Measure X Community Identified Spending Priorities:

Community Priority	Operating Categories	FY 2017-18 pre-Measure X	FY 2020-21 post-Measure X	FY 2021-22 post-Measure X	Change FY 2018 to FY 2022
Public Safety	Patrol	7,024,489	8,713,048	8,938,826	1,914,337
Public Safety	Investigative Services	1,399,821	1,374,203	1,426,873	27,052
Public Safety	Administration & Emergency Services	1,271,815	1,615,591	1,923,419	651,604
Public Safety	Support Services	1,153,678	1,847,659	2,070,054	900,655
Infrastructure	Maintenance & Public Facilities	933,507	963,040	1,129,814	196,307
Parks and Open Space	Parks and Grounds & Open Space	1,656,104	2,283,358	2,206,830	550,726
Recreation	Recreation	877,629	966,169	1,305,255	427,626
Recreation	Senior Center	427,263	330,072	411,528	(15,735)
NPDES	Administration & Municipal Maintenance	460,722	401,391	407,442	(53,280)
<b>Totals</b>		<b>\$15,205,028</b>	<b>\$18,494,531</b>	<b>19,820,042</b>	<b>\$4,599,292</b>

The table below shows audited Measure X revenue received in FY 2018-19, FY 2019-20, FY 2020-21, FY 2021-22, and unaudited Measure X revenue received in FY 2022-23 to date:

<b>Fiscal Year</b>	<b>FY 2018-19 Measure X*</b>	<b>FY 2019-20 Measure X</b>	<b>FY 2020-21 Measure X</b>	<b>FY 2021-22 Measure X</b>	<b>FY 2022-23 Measure X**</b>
<b>Revenue</b>	\$827,121	\$3,941,196	\$4,307,084	\$4,578,638	\$3,102,261

*\*Note: only one quarter of Measure X revenue was received in FY 2018-19*

*\*\*Note: unaudited payments to date, made in arrears*

Decreases in expenditures compared to the FY 2017-18 pre-Measure X baseline year remain under Senior Center and within the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES), although expenditure levels in both increased year over year from FY 2020-21 to FY 2021-22. The Senior Center had significantly reduced its services during the pandemic, particularly since seniors were considered in the high-risk category for COVID-19. Senior Center staff adjusted their service model during this period to assist with food aid and other types of aid for vulnerable residents within Martinez. For much of FY 2021-22, regular operations resumed at the Senior Center, and expenditures returned to more normalized levels as shown within this annual report. The NPDES expenditures reflect reduced job costing of staff time to the fund as staffing levels within Engineering have fluctuated. Staff anticipates additional expenditures will be associated with the onboarding of new Engineering staff members.

Also of note, Recreation had a significant increase in expenditures from FY 2020-21 to FY 2021-22 directly related to a return to more normal operating and staffing levels coming out of the pandemic. Additionally, the decrease of expenditures in investigative services shown in FY 2020-21 was due to the significant and ongoing shortage of police officers within the Department, which caused specialty assignments, like investigations, to be temporarily reduced so that patrol could be prioritized. In FY 2021-22, more officer assignments were made to investigative services as demonstrated by the resulting increases.

The table on the following page shows staffing levels within given community priority categories (Public Safety, City Infrastructure, and Parks, Open Space, and Recreation) from December 31, 2017 (pre-Measure X) to December 31, 2021 (post-Measure X):

Community Priority Category	12/31/17 Pre-Measure X Staffing Vacancies	12/31/19 Post-Measure X Staffing Vacancies	12/31/20 Post-Measure X Staffing Vacancies	12/31/21 Post-Measure X Staffing Vacancies	12/31/22 Post-Measure X Staffing Vacancies
Public Safety - Officers	5	2	3*	6	8
Public Safety – Dispatchers	5	2	3	0	1
Parks and Open Space Maintenance	1	0	0	1**	1**
Recreation	0	0	0	2	2
Senior Center	0	0	0	1	0

*\*Included two positions frozen during this time due to COVID-19 related cutbacks*

*\*\*new Park Caretaker II position designated for Rankin Aquatic Center assistance*

## Outcomes

The Committee expressed an interest in being able to show improved outcomes related to quality-of-life initiatives whenever possible, and as previously mentioned, to more closely align with the fiscal year period in question. The following list represents some examples of how the City has been able to support the Community Identified Spending Priorities, despite experiencing significant staffing shortages in FY 2021-22 that in some instances have persisted into the current fiscal year.

### Public Safety:

- Chief Manjit Sappal retired in March 2022, and Captain Beth Johnson departed the City in June 2022 and soon thereafter, the City commenced a recruitment for a new Chief of Police (successfully filled with the appointment of Chief Andrew White in November 2022). The Police Captain position remains vacant and retirements and staff departures in several sworn positions have created vacancies, some of which remain unfilled.
  - FY 2021 – 6 separations (including 2 retirements), 5 new hires (of which 3 are still with the City)
  - FY 2022 – 6 separations (including 3 retirements), 2 new hires (both of whom are still with the City)
- For the first time in almost 20 years, the department sponsored academy recruits
- Completed several significant promotions, including a tenured Sergeant to Lieutenant; two Officers to Sergeant; and a Records Clerk to Supervisor. Also staffed the professional standards sergeant position.
- Recent contractual adjustments with the Martinez Police Officers’ Association and approved by the City Council on May 18, 2022, secured salary increases for sworn personnel on January 1<sup>st</sup> of each year, starting in 2022 (at 6%) through 2025, when increases will range based on SF Bay Area Consumer Price Index/CPI thereafter. This long-term agreement is intended to improve the Department’s ability to retain and attract new staff, but staffing levels remain low.

- The Community Resource Officer program, which allows a full-time officer to be dedicated to working with the Coordinated Outreach Referral and Engagement (CORE) Team on homelessness, was temporarily placed on hold due to a staffing shortage and the need to prioritize patrol.
- Maintained funding for CORE services.
- Created partnership with Office of the Public Defender and the District Attorney's Office to provide holistic interventions to defendants charged with Misdemeanor crimes as an extension of the Early Rep program.
- The Patrol Training Team continued providing scenario-based training focusing on de-escalation methods. The concept for the training team is to put officers in real-life type scenarios to learn how to de-escalate rather than use force. These training regimens require motivated personnel, and the Department has recruited officers to develop and implement this essential training.
- Continued to provide regular patrols for outdoor dining on weekends and special events during the pandemic, as staffing allowed.
- Initiated a partnership with Orbit Health to provide mental health support to officers when dealing with community members experiencing a mental health crisis.
- Added a Police Assistant position as part of FY 2023 mid-cycle budget adopted by the City Council on June 29, 2022 (initially funded through American Rescue Plan Act funds but to be absorbed by the General Fund thereafter).
- Achieved full staffing the Dispatch Center as of December 31, 2021 (note: one vacancy exists as of the date of this report).
- Partnered with Contra Costa Consolidated Fire Department to implement ZoneHaven in 2021, a real-time software application designed to connect community members with up-to-date emergency incident status information (including evacuation orders), which will be critical in the event of a major disaster like a wildfire.

#### Parks and Open Space:

- Implemented labor contract with Local 324 (through June 30, 2027) with annual Cost of Living Adjustments and a one-time bonus to help with recruitment and retention of qualified maintenance personnel tasked with protecting and maintaining City infrastructure, including City parks and open space areas. Maintained full staffing in the division (excluding one Parks Caretaker II position still under consideration and not yet recruited, which would have specific duties and responsibilities at the Rankin Aquatic Center).
- Augmented the Measure H Parks Improvement Project in December 2021 with a \$320,036 transfer from General Fund Unassigned Reserves attributable to Measure X. This project will provide various enhancements and replacements at Hidden Lakes Park, Cappy Ricks Park, and Waterfront Park Field 5.

- Initiated a project to conduct expanded wildfire mitigation efforts in numerous areas encompassing roughly 515 acres of open space, including the Rankin Olive Grove (which included hiring multiple arborists and utilizing contract assistance for chippers and other equipment needed to support County Fire Hand Crews). The City mows and discs several areas to till and invert the vegetation to control fire risks by establishing fire breaks.
- Conducted encampment abatements which also help mitigate fire risk. Total expenditures are over \$350K from FY 2021 through FY 2022/early FY 2023.

#### Senior Center:

- Implemented free web-based email marketing service that simplified communication more efficiently to approximately 700 participants, enabling staff to send a weekly email, monthly bulletin, special events and notices during pandemic.
- Utilized community resources by obtaining partnerships with new organizations, The Kensington, Golden Years Placement Agency, Nob Hill, and The Lodge of Glen Cove that sponsored 17 curbside special events free to participants during pandemic.
- Increased daily participation of the CC Café program by 9% by offering a delivery service to homebound seniors.
- Successfully planned and implemented 68 curbside programs and events for 2,128 participants as alternatives for in-person gatherings due to pandemic.
- Partnered with various agencies to provide resources and services to meet the demands and needs of our aging population. The Center provides weekly or monthly services at no cost, including Senior Peer Counseling, Health Insurance Counseling, Consult-an Attorney, Free Wills Clinic and Dementia Family Caregiver Support Group. These services provide substantial cost savings to senior participants.
- Partnered with four surrounding cities to offer Inclusive Recreation Programming for Adults with Disabilities 18 years of age and older.
- Partnered with Contra Costa Tax-Aide in spring of 2022 to provide free 2021 tax year support for seniors. Volunteers prepared 171 tax returns and offered advice and assistance to 232 Martinez residents. The returns generated \$17,600 in Earned Income Credits, \$15,500 in Child Tax Credits and \$169,000 in refunds. The Martinez clientele saved \$50,000 on costs they might have spent to have their tax returns prepared elsewhere.
- The Senior Nutrition Program and Meals on Wheels are two vital programs offered to senior participants in the community. City staff continue to support these programs through daily coordination with both agencies. Meals on Wheels served 58 participants weekly receiving the equivalent of 406 meals per week, and Café Costa (the cafeteria-style senior nutrition program operated out of the Martinez Senior Center) served 702 participants with a nutritious meal on site.

- Offered fitness classes at the Martinez Senior Center to a total of 1,300 participants.
- Partnered with County Connection to assist participants inquiring about transportation. A representative from County Connection comes to the Center once a month to assist with processing clipper cares, RTC Cards, applying for paratransit, route information and trip planning.
- Hired new Senior Citizens Coordinator in early 2022, which has helped to bring a fresh perspective on programming and marketing of senior services.

### Recreation

- Vacancies in the Recreation Admin Aide and Recreation Coordinator positions in 2021 were addressed and successful recruitments were completed in 2022 with the hiring of new replacements for these positions. Additionally, the City commenced recruitment of the Recreation Manager position approved in 2021 to support capacity building for recreation services and special events.
- Conducted a facility needs assessment of Rankin Aquatic Center in Spring 2022 to prepare for the replacement of two pool heaters, and to prioritize future upgrades to pool equipment and the facility. A contract has been awarded for replacement and enhancement of the pool chemical lines and replacement of two pool heaters is expected to begin in December 2022 in anticipation of the 2023 swim season, all as part of a Council-approved Capital Improvement Project using Measure X funds.
- Booked all ballfields and soccer fields for daily rentals.
- Completed license agreement through City Council and hosted successful Martinez Sturgeon seasons in FY 2021 and FY 2022 Waterfront Park Field 3.
- Successfully organized and hosted summer camps in FY 2021 and FY 2022 for approximately 90 kids each session and maintained COVID-19 safety protocols.
- Processed dozens of special event applications and provided planning and operational support to numerous major citywide events that were reinstated including Alhambra High School Homecoming Parade, 4<sup>th</sup> of July Parade, and Chamber of Commerce's King of County BBQ Challenge and Martini Gala.
- Spearheaded several reinstated community events, including Holiday Frolic and 4<sup>th</sup> of July Fireworks.
- Submitted competitive federal appropriations request with Congressman Mike Thompson's office for \$2.5 million to renovate the fishing pier in April 2022. The Congressman selected the City's project and the funding was subsequently authorized in FY 2023 as part of the Omnibus Appropriations Bill.



### NPDES/Stormwater Pollution and Prevention:

- A seminar was recently hosted by the California Urban Streams Partnership in partnership with the Contra Costa Resources Conservation District regarding vegetation management for the Lower Alhambra Creek area. On March 16, 2022, as part of the City's mid-year budget adjustments, \$140,000 was transferred to NPDES and attributed to Measure X for vegetation management and implementation of the Lower Alhambra Creek Watershed Management Plan. Stormwater and pollution prevention expenses utilizing these Measure X funds will begin showing up in subsequent Oversight Committee reports.

### **Next Steps**

Accept and move the report to the next available City Council meeting.